Chapter 9: Reflective practice and oral folk tradition: quarrying the Celtic Imaginary?

Chapters 7 and 8 identify physical and social locations where folk traditions are popularly accepted as having taken place since time immemorial, sometimes with continuity and sometimes with interruptions and revivals. Chapter 9 moves on to consider locations where the performance of a tradition is subject to greater reflection and perhaps more creativity. It is argued that these add to, rather than detract from, the process of folk tradition. Here, the folk process takes place in a second existence, according to Hoerburger’s model where it is consciously revived, or cultivated by a given group of people. The group of people considered here are the Celto-Cornish movement, who have a shared sense of the Celtic imaginary in relation to folk tradition and a discursivity, which distinguishes between the English and the Cornish.

Although the extent to which any “imaginary” is shared, must vary from individual to individual here it is taken that there will be a common element around Cornwall’s oppositional identity to England. Deacon shows that by the last decade of the twentieth century this movement had “fused its Celticity with the classical industrial Cornish identity. In doing so, notions of Cornishness as incompatible with Englishness took firmer root. These now feed off an appropriately more oppositional new nativist Cornish history….”. Thus, for the Celto-Cornish movement, icons of nineteenth century Cornishness such as bal maidens, fish jowsters, gooks and tea treats (see appendix 5: Glossary) all became part of the Celtic imaginary and symbols of Cornish distinctiveness. These symbols blended naturally with the nineteenth century music, dances and folkloric customs described by Bottrell, Courtney and Hunt et al.

Deacon suggests the past has been “.... quarried since the eighteenth century in order to emphasise difference and to claim special treatment whether in terms of ecclesiastical government in the nineteenth century or political devolution in the late twentieth”. The chapters in Section two examined the evolution of a canon of folk phenomena that was perceived or adopted as distinctly Cornish. This chapter will argue that whilst this was in a sense “quarrying” folk tradition to provide both a medium and a material for the expression of a modern Cornish identity, this is a two way process in that folk tradition is itself fuelled by evolving perceptions of identity. This two way relationship may well be evident in the reflexivity observed in first existence folk tradition but it is in the reflectivity of second existence that the oppositional and more nativist expression of Cornish identity described by Deacon becomes most apparent.
Dorson introduced the notion that some folk traditions are “fakelore” and driven by commercial interests rather than historical provenance. Harker pursued this further from a Marxist perspective to argue that the concept of a “British folk song tradition” was manufactured in order to sustain a political ideology around class. Hobsbawm and Ranger took a similar position in suggesting that the “Invention of tradition” was a device to legitimise hegemony. These critiques are shown to be over simplistic by commentators such as Boyse and Bearman but there nevertheless remains a notion that all traditions are invented.

In examining folk tradition in a second existence, Chapter nine will show that this notion relies on a static model of tradition that does not take into account its dynamic properties as a process. In the first place, it may be that all traditions are “created” in that they have a point of origin, but, particularly for folk tradition, this point of origin may itself be informed by earlier folk phenomena. Furthermore, as a psychosocial phenomenon, folk tradition shares with memory and identity the property of change, of being an active process rather than a static artefact. Because of this interaction, not only will material outcomes change but also so will the meanings and significance attributed to traditional folk phenomena.

Schwartz shows that sites of memory are not necessarily geographical:

“Sacred sites are lieux de mémoire, but so are the flag and anthem, monument and shrine, sanctuary and ruin, statue and bust, portrait and history painting, coin and medallion, holiday and ritual. Literature, film, and popular visual imagery in such popular media as postcards, cartoons, and posters, these, too, are important lieux de mémoire”.

In this sense festivals like Lowender Peran, Aberfest and the Penseythen Kernewek, are also sites of memory as are events arranged up by organisations such as the Celtic Congress, Cornish Gorsedh and Old Cornwall Societies. Schwartz explains that these sites are experiences of memory as an active process and that the meanings associated with them change and evolve with time.

Assman describes these experiences of memory as concretions of identity:
“in the context of objectivized culture and of organized or ceremonial communication, a close connection to groups and their identity exists which is similar to that found in the case of everyday memory. We can refer to the structure of knowledge in this case as the "concretion of identity." With this we mean that a group bases its consciousness of unity and specificity upon this knowledge and derives formative and normative impulses from it, which allows the group to reproduce its identity.”

The tasks of this chapter are thus to clarify the distinction between first and second existence folk tradition, to identify the people involved and to explore the interaction between the Celto-Cornish movement, identity and the folk process. This chapter draws on evidence and examples provided by participatory action research methods and project work undertaken in partnership with the Cornish Dance Society, the Lowender Peran Festival and the An Daras Cornish Folk Arts Project.

**How does the second existence of folk tradition differ from the first?**

Hoerburger\(^{15}\) introduced the concept of folk dance existing in a first (original) and second (revived) existence and Nahachewsky\(^{16}\) developed this to recognise, and contrast, the impact of reflexivity and reflectivity within these two existences. This model is taken a stage further in this study. It is used to embraces a wider spectrum of folk phenomena that includes all music, dance and associated customs. The Hoerburger / Nahachewsky based model is useful in that it focuses enquiry on process, influences and change rather than a descriptive analysis that assigns phenomena to a subjective taxonomy.

At first it seems very arbitrary to describe the St Agnes Bolster day which was introduced in 1994 as a folk tradition in its original setting and yet discuss the Lowender Peran festival, first held in 1978 and much more established, as a new or revived location. According to Hoerburger’s model, however, the contextual location of the St Agnes Bolster Day is the same as much older customs. It is a community event, which takes place in the same social setting as more established Guize dance customs and draws upon local tradition i.e. the legend of Giant Bolster. The accompanying musicians are arguably a revival of the nineteenth century shallal band (see Appendix 5: Glossary) but the musical arrangement is reflexive in that it borrows from the style of the Samba band which is currently a popular form of community music group.\(^{17}\)  
Lowender Peran, on the other hand, is a self-conscious statement of Celticity and
carefully reflects on what it should be representing as Cornish and Celtic in folk tradition.

Lowender Peran owes its origin to the Pan Celtic movement and the increasing expression of this movement through festival culture in the 1970s. In its formative years, it enjoyed the patronage and support of Polig Montjarret, Vice president of the Festival Interceltique and Con O’Connail, Chief Executive of the Irish Feile Pan Cheilteach. This is important as it marks a very clear association with, and recognition by, a wider Pan-Celtic movement. Celto-Cornish discursivity is implicit in the published aims of the festival: “to encourage recognition of Cornwall’s heritage and Celtic links as a vibrant, living tradition that people of all ages and backgrounds can participate in and enjoy”. This festival voices a speech community, which recognises a distinctive Cornish and Celtic heritage.

There is a parallel here with Deacon’s discussion of nested and oppositional identities of Cornishness. Where history and identity are interpreted in such a way as to be distinctively Cornish but part of a wider British / English whole it is a nested identity, whereas an oppositional identity is an interpretation where the two are mutually exclusive. The evolving custom at St Agnes carries a clear message of Cornishness in its association with legend but does not engages in an overt oppositional Cornish / English discursivity. Participants and observers would be aware of the essential Cornish nature of the custom but if they perceived the event as nested within wider English folk tradition there is little about the event that would challenge this. Lowender Peran is, however, quite ostentatious in its oppositional stance with performers framed as representing each of the six Celtic nations, including Cornwall alongside of Wales, Scotland, the Isle of Man, Ireland and Brittany. Here, the festival is acting reflectively by interpreting Cornish tradition and history within the discursive framework of the Celto-Cornish movement.

This oppositional stance is illustrated by the conditions laid down for stallholders taking part in the “Celtic Market” that takes place during the festival:

“Lowender Peran has a policy of displaying goods made in Cornwall, and would prefer goods labelled “Made in Cornwall” or “Made in Great Britain” as we feel Cornwall is a Celtic part of Great
Britain and not of South West England. We ask all stall holders to look carefully at labelling.\textsuperscript{21}

This may allow for a “nested in Britain” identity but expressly excludes an English identity for Cornwall. An interesting paradox arose during the 2007 festival, which invites closer examination of this oppositional stance. Although the festival is strictly apolitical, political organisations that also have a clear cultural remit in relation to Cornish culture and identity are invited to take part in the festival by having stalls with information and merchandising in the Celtic Market. Mebyon Kernow\textsuperscript{22} is a political organisation with just such a cultural remit but found its stall under criticism from festival directors for merchandising goods labelled “made in China”. The goods in question were tokens of Cornish identity such as St Piran’s flags and Cornish nationality stickers for cars so were ostentatious in their expression of Cornish identity. What happened here is that the festival was placing an emphasis on Cornish culture by being “Made in Cornwall”\textsuperscript{23} whereas Mebyon Kernow was merchandising goods that would give a strong message of Cornish identity as well as being a useful form of fundraising. In order to do this high profit margins were important thus the purchase from large international organisations who offered competitive rates. This shows that even between two organisations that share membership of the Celto-Cornish speech community, outcomes from the discursivity of that community can be contradictory.

\textbf{Who are the people involved in second existence Cornish folk tradition?}

Given that the borders between first and second existence folk tradition are grey, one of the markers is that performers within the second existence are likely to have made a much clearer decision about selecting and interpreting the material they are going to perform than performers in the first existence. To clarify this with an example, the singers in an informal session (i.e. a first existence setting) will be spontaneous in their selection of material whereas a group of singers that rehearse in a structured way (second existence setting) will select according to the musical style and identity they wish to project. Pete Berryman’s description of the evolving repertoire of the bands that he worked with provides an illustration: “Blue Ticket’s repertoire was mostly our own compositions but when we formed West we wanted to incorporate more of a Cornish identity into what we did and as well as composed material we used some traditional items.”\textsuperscript{24} The performers who signify their identification with the Celto-Cornish speech community by their choice of material, group name and how they present themselves provide the location for Cornish folk tradition in its second existence.
It is not possible to quantify in absolute terms the number of groups in Cornwall with a repertoire informed by the desire to express Cornish identity nor is it possible to analyse their material in terms of oral folk tradition, commercial or art music. A group may form and rehearse for a single event and then disband. It is however possible to gain a snapshot of performers who are sufficiently sustained and organised to market albums of their material. Kesson is a specialist website selling CDs by Cornish musicians and in September 2010 they advertised a total of 85 albums representing the work of 60 groups. The charts below provide an analysis of the performers in terms of age, gender, group name and album content.
Chapter 9: Reflective practice and oral folk tradition

**Chart 3: Performer Name**

- Other: 40%
- Cornish: 34%
- Identified with Cornwall: 26%

**Chart 4: Album Content**

- Composition: 47%
- Traditional: 40%
- General Celtic: 3%
- Cornish Language: 10%
The proportion of under / over thirty year olds approximately matches the population profile in Cornwall of 1:4 but taking into account the number of groups with mixed ages it could be argued that the number is higher. The significance here is that there is no indication that there are a disproportionate number of older or younger people involved in this activity. The male / female ratio of approximately 3:1 does not reflect the profile in Cornwall although if the Male Voice Choirs are removed from the calculation, the ratio is nearer 2:1. The majority of performance groups are mixed, however, which does temper this figure. Figures regarding the gender ratios of performers within the broad folk music genre are not readily available but the anecdotal evidence provided by examining folk event billing would suggest that male artists are often in the majority.

Exposure to the Cornish language is limited in the mass media and any engagement with the language will be an active rather than passive process. It is therefore argued here that performers using the language for album titles or band names are actively identifying themselves with a Celto-Cornish speech community. Where names and titles are in English, significance of identity depends upon the narratives of performance but two of these performers made clear during interviews that they saw themselves and their music as part of the Cornish music revival. The chart shows that well over half the performers used names identifying themselves as Cornish.

The content of the albums showed a slight bias towards composition but it is also clear from this chart that music from oral tradition plays a significant part of the repertoire of these performers. What does seem significant is the contrast in the number of groups using Cornish names in relation to the relatively small amount of material sung in the Cornish language. Whilst this is in part a reflection of the amount of instrumental music on the albums, it is significant in that it shows that performers are using the Cornish language as a badge without it necessarily being incorporated into their repertoire.

Whilst the Kesson catalogue provides a snapshot of performance around songs and instrumental music, Lowender Peran provides a slightly wider view with the list of performers taking part in the festival between 1978 and 2008 published in the anniversary programme that includes theatre, dance and storytelling. A complete list of performers is provided in appendix 4.13, a summary is provided below:
Table 2 Summary of Cornish performers at Lowender Peran 1978 - 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total no of performers</th>
<th>Performer Names</th>
<th>Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total no of performers</td>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>Cornish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>123</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All 123 performers were selected by the festival on the basis that they were able to provide a programme that reflected a distinctive Cornish culture, either in the material selected or in narrative. The analysis in the above table shows that 64 performers overtly identified with the Celto-Cornish speech community, either by using a Cornish band name (52) or dialect name (12). A further 15 performer names were linked to Cornwall by use of a place name which indicates a local association with Cornwall but provides no information about the extent to which the members identify with the Celto-Cornish movement. Likewise, no indication of a sense of identity is provided by performers’ names that were personal or bore no obvious connection with Cornwall.

This table also shows what type of performance the groups were engaged in but detailed information is not readily available as to the extent to which this drew on the body of material from oral tradition identified the database. Video footage of the Gwary Dons – Celtic Dance Spectacular\(^{28}\) does however show that the dance display groups drew largely upon traditional material in their choreography.

Between September 2007 and August 2008 the Cornish Dance Society undertook a survey amongst its members to provide data about the numbers of people involved in Cornish dance (See appendix 4.11). The data collected includes details of displays, workshops, club nights and festivals all of which, it is argued here, are second existence folk tradition on the basis that performance is reflective and careful consideration is given to history, background and origin. Seven out of eight dance groups actively involved in the events described during this period, responded. The survey did not include adult education classes, dance clubs at schools or groups who may have formed for a particular occasion so the number of events and audience is therefore likely to be understated. It nevertheless provides an indication of the range and extent of activity taking place within the second existence of folk tradition.
Table 3: Cornish Dance Society survey: Summary of second existence events

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No of events</th>
<th>Audience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Displays</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>4920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Club nights</td>
<td>80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Displays were provided by the groups in a variety of settings ranging from informal street dancing to main-stage events at festivals and here the emphasis would be on those dances that provided, or could be choreographed to provide the most effective spectacle. Groups often provide interpretation and information about the origin of dances as part of the performance, both of which emphasise the reflective nature of the performance. Workshops are less concerned with spectacle and more focussed on the intrinsic interest of the dance and might seek to provide an overview of Cornish dance. As well as practice and rehearsal, club nights provide an opportunity to try out different and possibly newly written dances.

Audiences for a display are being entertained rather than actively engaging in a folk tradition whereas people attending a workshop are arguably participants. It is interesting within the context of first and second settings for folk tradition to contrast participation in dance workshops with participation in social dance at Troyls / Ceilis etc. During the latter, the roles are essentially that of entertainer and audience. In dance workshops, however, there is a teacher / student relationship between the group and the attendees, which will include questions and reflection about the dance and how it is to be performed.

An interesting group of performers that help to illustrate the line between first and second existence of folk tradition in Cornwall are the street or processional bands. On the one hand, it can be argued that they are part of an established tradition of Shallal or Guize dance bands (See app 5 Glossary). On the other, they perform away from a specific date in the calendar and are not tied to a geographic location. Furthermore, they take a considered and reflective approach towards how they will pursue the tradition of Cornish identity and are thus operating in a second existence. Consider the following examples:
Table 4: Cornish Shallal bands and processional Guize dance groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Band Name</th>
<th>Instruments</th>
<th>Music Repertoire</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Falmouth Marine Band</strong></td>
<td>Mostly commercial sized treacle tins – and whistles.</td>
<td>Percussive</td>
<td>In procession they emulate a marching band. Dress involves full “regalia” of Cornish tartans. They also use a historical “marine” costume involving red jackets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hornets</strong></td>
<td>Brass and wind instruments,</td>
<td>Newly written and traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Inspired by Dunstan’s references to Horners. Dress is “rugby style” black yellow and gold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Crowders</strong></td>
<td>Fiddles and violas,</td>
<td>Newly written or traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Inspired by Dunstan’s references to Crowders. Dress is “rugby style” black yellow and gold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rubber Band</strong></td>
<td>Any Instruments that turn up (thus the name “Rubber Band” group could be any size.</td>
<td>Newly written or traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Calstock Village “Folk Band”, “Carnival” Dress with some black yellow and gold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Turkey Rhubarb Band</strong></td>
<td>Variety of instruments percussion and Tuba dominate.</td>
<td>Largely traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Guize dancers with masks and horses Skull</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Golowan Band</strong></td>
<td>Variety of instruments accordions and percussion dominate</td>
<td>Largely traditional</td>
<td>May Day “Whites” Musicians drawn from Mazey Day Procession in Penzance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Penguizers</strong></td>
<td>Bagpipes and drums</td>
<td>Largely Traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Guize Dancers with Masks and horses Skull</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ramrods</strong></td>
<td>Accordions and Drums</td>
<td>Largely Cornish / Celtic</td>
<td>May Day “Whites”, Musicians drawn from Padstow Obby Oss and Padstow Mummers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bolingey Troyl Band</strong></td>
<td>Variety of instruments</td>
<td>Newly written or traditional Cornish</td>
<td>Part of display dance group “folk” style dress with some black and yellow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 9: Reflective practice and oral folk tradition

Cornish identity and the folk process

What informs reflectivity within the process of folk tradition here, is not strictly speaking the archival collections of antiquarians and folklorists or the recollections and recording of past society but this information transplanted into an ever-changing contemporary contextual interpretation. The recorders and mediators of folk phenomena from the early days of the Old Cornwall Societies through Dunstan and Gundry to the Racca Project identified, and added to, a body of material perceived as Cornish. What Schwartz and Assman show us here is that there is a sense, in which this body of material also becomes a site of memory so that its significance and meaning are subject to a process of constant change.

Cornish Language

This thesis considers the process of oral folk tradition during a critical period in the evolution of Cornish identity, a period within which we are fortunate in having a large amount of data available. One of the striking changes over this period has been the relationship between the Cornish language and identity in Cornwall. In 1810, Cornish was arguably at an all time low with little interest in it being expressed by the vernacular or academic communities except, as in the case of Gilbert, to celebrate its passing. By 1910, it had gained the interest of a small group of people who practiced an academic interest but recognised its potential as a symbol of Cornish distinctiveness. In 2010 it is still far from being the vernacular language of medieval times but it enjoys official sanction, academic scrutiny and importantly, from the point of view of examining the process of folk tradition, popular interest in the wider community. Cornish may not be widely spoken as a conversational language but it enjoys increasing use as a badge of identity. One way in which this is evident lies in the popularity of Cornish for personal names and house names together with the interest in the origins of family and place names.

Another, very accessible, way of engaging in the language without speaking it is through song and there has been an increasing connection between Cornish and folk tradition. Although its influences are clearly present in some dialect items, there is very little Cornish Language material recorded in the nineteenth century. By the latter half of the twentieth century, however, both Gundry (1960) and Kennedy (1975) saw fit to publish Cornish translations and by the time of the Kanow Tavern project in 2007 (see appendix 4.3) it was becoming difficult to attribute translations to given individuals as these had entered into the public domain. The Cornish language has impacted upon
the folk process in both reflective and reflexive situations. Some performers are pro-active in promoting the language because they feel that using Cornish for band names, tune names or as a medium for singing is an appropriate way of interpreting material from Cornwall and expressing their Cornishness. Other performers respond to this lead in a more passive, reflexive, way accepting this as the “done thing”.

**Influencing musical style**

The reflective / reflexive process model of oral folk tradition used as an enquiry tool for this thesis is one of degrees, shades and judgement rather than absolute values. This is particularly evident when examining reflective practice and making a judgement about whether an arrangement, a style or a choreography represents continuity within the process of oral tradition or the creative activity of an individual or group of individuals. The folk process trajectory of a Carol called “Choirs of Angels” provides an example of the way in which notions of Cornish identity can affect the way in which music is arranged and adapted. Dunstan learned this carol from his father who came by it in 1865. In 1993, the author arranged this as an instrumental and the diagram below outlines how the structure of the melody was changed:

**Diagram 4: Choirs of Angels as published by Ralph Dunstan**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3 (repeat of bar 1)</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time Signature</td>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>4/2</td>
<td>3/2</td>
<td>2/2 (One note)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Diagram 5: Cor Elow (Choir of Angels) as arranged by Author**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bars</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3 (repeat of bar 1)</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>Last 3 bars ignored</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time Signature</td>
<td>5/4</td>
<td>5/4</td>
<td>5/4</td>
<td>5/4</td>
<td>4 X 4-bar phrases added, each a variation on the first.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The drive to express a distinctive identity in Cornwall also influenced the subsequent trajectory of this tune. During the project it was paired with a song composed by John Mills, \textsuperscript{38} Tansys Golowan, also in 5/4 time. Both tunes were included as instrumentals in the Racca project of 1995/1997 \textsuperscript{39} and had evidently stimulated interest as a further two 5/4 instrumentals were composed and included in the pack that underpinned this project. In 2010 some eight 5/4 tunes had been composed and were regularly being played at instrumental music sessions \textsuperscript{40} and had a dance written to go with them. \textsuperscript{41} Whilst the introduction of newly composed 5/4 instrumentals into the repertoire of instrumental sessions in Cornwall is clearly a creative rather than reflective activity, drawing inspiration from Dunstan’s original carol was arguably a reflective one.

O’Connor \textsuperscript{42} explains whilst 5 beats in the bar are not uncommon in vocal tradition they are rare in British instrumental tradition. \textsuperscript{43} He points out that they do sometimes occur in Breton music, however, and suggests that part of the attraction for Cornish performers was this link with Brittany. What we have here then is the chance arrangement of an element of oral folk tradition, i.e. four bars of a carol with an interesting time signature, triggering the composition and addition to the Cornish session repertoire of a number of tunes with the same unusual feature. It is clear that this is exercise of preference driven by the Celto-Cornish movement and the desire to interpret Cornish music as something distinctive but linked to Breton culture. This drive, however, is part of the process of oral tradition within a speech community and not artistic creativity on the part of an individual or the realisation of any commerciality. As other parts of the process, such as selectivity and change, impact over time, it will be seen whether this becomes a recognised feature of traditional music in Cornwall.

Selecting the Songs

Atkinson \textsuperscript{44} suggests that the vernacular texts of the eighteenth Century and nineteenth century broadsides were as much part of the traditional folk process as oral transmission despite being in written form. He explains that “Unlike the ‘literary’ texts presented for example, in Percy’s relics, individual texts of this kind carry no special authority in themselves but rather inherent reference outwards towards all their other actual and potential manifestations, regardless of format, embracing the possibility of variation as well as of continuity”. \textsuperscript{45} Atkinson’s analysis allows for an interesting parallel in modern Cornwall, the song sheets produced for community singing by Cornish organisations such as the Old Cornwall Society, the Cornish branch of the
Celtic Congress and the Cornish Federation of Women’s Institutes. These song sheets also carry no special authority and may be transcribed from memory or from other textual sources including another organisation’s song sheets. Below are examples of a list of songs from two of these sheets:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>St Columb Old Cornwall Society Midsummer Bonfire 23/6/2008</th>
<th>Withiel Women’s Institute Harvest Supper Meeting 18/10/2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Universal Cornish Favourites</td>
<td>1 Universal Cornish Favourites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Camborne Hill</td>
<td>1. Lamorna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Little Eyes</td>
<td>2. Little Eyes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Lamorna</td>
<td>3. The White Rose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Sweet Nightingale*</td>
<td>5. Sweet Nightingale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The Old Grey Duck*</td>
<td>6. Cadgwith Anthem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The White Rose</td>
<td>7. Cornish Lads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Trelawny</td>
<td>8. Trelawny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Influenced by Celto-Cornish movement</td>
<td>2 Influenced by Celto-Cornish movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trelawny</td>
<td>Trelawny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Other</td>
<td>10. Hail to the Homeland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. The Oggie Song</td>
<td>11. Cornish Lads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Hymn</td>
<td>3 Other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These singing sessions are folk tradition in a second existence as selection is taking place reflectively as to what it would be appropriate and popular to sing at an event celebrating Cornishness. These lists can be divided into three groups of influences. The first group are universal Cornish favourites and included in collections like Gundry and Kennedy. Whilst the first group are arguably influenced by the notion of a distinctive Cornish repertoire encouraged by the Celto-Cornish movement it is the second group with songs as Bro Goth Agan Tasow which reflect a specifically oppositional Cornish identity.

Other “Cornish” is an interesting group of songs that invites some discussion around nested and oppositional identities. These are songs that were not identified by correspondents for the Cornish Pub Song Project (see appendix 4.3) and do not often materialise in the form of Cornish translations for song sheets. *My Grandfathers Clock* shares American origins with *Maggie May* and *Little Lize* but unlike the latter songs it
remains widely popular in Britain and America so that its credentials are not good in terms of oppositional Cornish identity. Likewise, *The Blackbird* has been popularised as a West Country standard by the Wurzels and sits better with a nested identity than an oppositional. It can be seen that the pastoral, Westcountry “mummerset” culture represented by the Wurzels is the antithesis of the culture of Celtic nationality embraced by the Celto-Cornish movement. The complexity of perceived identities, however, is thrown into sharp relief by the case study of the *Oggie Song*. Evidence points to its origins in the Royal Navy and the barracks at Devonport but it is immediately identifiable with Cornwall and the pasty. John Ellery, secretary for the St Columb Old Cornwall Society, commented that the *Oggie Song* and had been included in their song sheet by one of his predecessors but none of the members wanted to sing it as it was not “proper Cornish”. In contrast to this not only did the song feature in Bodmin’s celebration of St Piran’s Day 2007 but the band billed for the evening was Chris Lundy and The Oggie Men. They provided a programme that was a mixture of Wurzles tribute songs and written material on topics such as the beast of Bodmin that adopted a similar performance style. The room was, however, bedecked in Cornish and Celtic flags and the master of ceremonies for the evening made clear a distinctive view of Cornish identity, both in his kilted attire and presentation of the evening.

*Identity in Context*

Another way in which the Celto-Cornish movement has influenced the performance of folk material is to provide contextual settings. An example of this was a production called *Don’t take sugar* at Lowender Peran in 2001. This was a participatory project where various performers involved in the festival worked with groups of children to explore the custom in Cornwall of “not taking sugar in tea except with a pasty”. This custom is understood to be an echo of the popularity of the anti-slavery movement in early nineteenth century Cornwall and a campaign to reduce consumption of sugar in order to put economic pressure on manufacturers who took advantage of the slave trade.

This symbolises the cultural memory of radical liberalism in Cornwall, a cultural memory at odds with the stereotypical image of the Cornish as a peripheral provincial community who remain behind the times on equality issues. The performance utilised dances and songs from oral folk tradition to illustrate both the Cornish opposition to the slave trade and the particular story of Joseph Emidy an ex-slave and talented musician who progressed from playing jigs and reels to entertain shipmates as
a sailor, to dance band master and music teacher in Truro and Helston. He was unable to work as a musician in London because of his ethnic background but became a celebrity in “provincial” Cornwall. A Furry dance was used to act as a boat to connect different parts of the performance together and a sea shanty, Sally Brown, provided a musical link throughout the event. A further dimension of Cornish identity was provided by the use of St Piran’s flags and dress that identified with both mining and the sea. Here, then, an historical narrative was combined with material from oral folk tradition to create a cultural memory which accommodated a modern, diversity sensitive, Cornish identity that challenged stereotypes.

Costume and identity

There is a sense in which all performance has a theatrical element in dress, whether it is the formality of the symphony orchestra, the colour co-ordination of a musical or the studied counter culture of popular music. It is natural, therefore, to seek to enhance the performance of folk tradition by adopting a distinctive dress that carries the desired message, in this case of one of a Cornish, or Celto-Cornish identity. Most, if not all, performers within second existence folk tradition adopt articles of dress proclaiming Cornishness at one time or another. For musicians and folk bands this is not always ostentatious as it can merge with the informal and counter cultural image that has become associated with this genre. Spectacle is an essential part of the performance of dance display groups and street processional bands however and it is here that Cornish identity is most overtly expressed through costume. The inspiration for this dress can be shown to come from two sources, those drawn from modern statements of Cornish identity and those found by “quarrying the past”.

Howlett discusses the success of Cornish tartans as a modern statement of Cornishness and these give rise to a variety of formal and informal wear that can be utilised to express Cornish identity. The St Piran’s flag is included as part of this identity package along with the Cornish colours of black and deep yellow that form part of Cornish rugby culture. All of which is arguably a site of identity in the way described by Schwartz. Thus when groups consider how best to reflect Cornish identity in their performance these badges of Cornishness are readily available and the images of Guizers in appendices 4.1, 4.4, 4.5, 4.6, and 4.8 together with the dance display teams in appendix 4.15 illustrate this and show a variety of tartan, black, white and yellow colours being utilised. Whilst it is clear that a Cornish identity is being expressed here, there is no measure to indicate what kind of Cornish identity is being perceived at a
personal level. However, it is difficult to see that anyone involved in wearing kilts or tartan would not at least be aware of the Celto-Cornish movement and the identification with the other Celtic countries even if their own perception was that of a nested rather than oppositional Cornish identity.

In the light of Roper’s deconstruction of the Scottish tradition of tartans and kilts the Cornish tartan dress is an interesting phenomenon. The chequered design depicted in the images of the fishwives shawl, by both the Newlyn School of Artists and the early portrait photographers (see appendix 4.15) could well have served to provide substance to E.E. Morton Nance’s justification for a Cornish tartan but he makes no mention of them. He prefers, instead, an allusion to classical images of Celtic warriors and Arthurian connections and thus fits Ropers critique like a glove. Nance’s tartan found a post modernist niche in the fabric of Cornish identity and required no background of authenticity to become popular. Hobsbawm himself commented, “the Cornish are fortunate to be able to paint their regional discontents in the attractive colours of Celtic tradition, which makes them so much more viable”. In Cornwall, it was as if kilts and tartans were a tradition waiting to be invented.

One of the outcomes of the fusion of classical industrial Cornish identity with Celticity described by Deacon is the interest in nineteenth century costume. Both the Newlyn School of painters and the greeting card culture of the early photographic industry capture a romantic image of nineteenth century historic working class dress and provide a wealth of visual images for folk performers. The fish jousters and bal maidens in particular provide powerful symbols for the Celto-Cornish movement. The costume of the fish jouter features a black bonnet shaped to carry the strap of the fish basket and a striking red or tartan cloak. It first makes an appearance in the late eighteenth century drawing of a fish market and is the clothing that archetypal Cornish characters Dolly Pentreath and Mary Kelynack are often portrayed as wearing. The bal maidens (surface mine workers) wore a kind of protective bonnet which they called a “gook”. The shape of the gook provided the opportunity for both stylisation within different companies and decoration for Sunday best.

The distinctive dress of the mining and fishing industries and the women associated with it provides a site of cultural memory that reinforces Cornish distinctivity for the Celto-Cornish movement. In the first place, the costumes are strongly associated with fishing and mining which provide the cornerstones of identity in terms
of industrial heritage. In a second and more subtle way, these women represent independence. Social necessity brought on by the frequent absence of men folk resulted in these women earning their own wage and being financially independent in a wider British culture where this was rare.\textsuperscript{66} This may have been a matter of expedience rather than desirability for families in the nineteenth century, but by the twenty first century, it was symbolic of healthy independence.\textsuperscript{67} Ó Giolláin suggests that, “as part of the national or regional heritage, folklore is of ideological importance and has often provided a reservoir of symbols for identity politics”.\textsuperscript{68} The costume of Bal Maidens and Fish jousters also provide just such folkloric symbols for identity politics in Cornwall.

It is difficult to find an example of a Cornish dance display team that have never used historic costume based on the fishing and mining industries and the photographs of groups from the nineteen seventies through to the twenty first century in appendix 4.15 illustrates the various dress adopted. Using such costume is a reflective exercise. Research into the origins of dance in Cornwall tends to sign post the nineteenth century as a period when social dance was widely popular\textsuperscript{69} and the reasoning is therefore that the costume of the time is an appropriate way in which to add spectacle.

It is tempting to label this reflectivity as the product of folklorismus i.e.”the performance of folk culture away from its original local context, the playful imitation of popular motifs by another social class, and the invention and creation of folklore for different purposes outside any known tradition”.\textsuperscript{70} It is certainly the convention of the Europeade folk dance movement to borrow motifs from peasant dress in order to construct a suitable costume image\textsuperscript{71} and this is also the case within the pan Celtic movement. Woods, for example, demonstrates the romantic origins and synthetic nature of the costume\textsuperscript{72} favoured by Welsh dance groups. In Cornwall, however, it seems as if there was a “failure” to create a synthesised traditional costume and the dance groups resorted instead to the historic dress of the nineteenth century recorded by painting and photograph.

\textit{Identity as an accelerant for the folk process}

The post modernist success of the Celto-Cornish kilts and tartans without the need for established tradition or historical authenticity also raises another question; does this movement actually depend in any way upon folk tradition for its contemporary identity? The short answer to that is probably not as there was noticeably little
engagement in folk tradition outside of the Old Cornwall Societies during the formative and most difficult period of the movement's development. What seems to have happened is that the natural process of folk tradition has fed off the Cornish identities created by the Celto-Cornish movement and in doing so provided materials and artefacts to support that movement so that there is an almost symbiotic relationship.

To translate from abstract to concrete terms an example of this is the music for the Bardic processions associated with the Cornish Gorsedh. In 1984 a procession was held in Truro leading to a proclamation (shortened version of the Gorsedh ceremony) at the Cathedral. The procession was lead by a local band called the Nimrods who played a variety of tunes, none of which had any connection with Cornwall but did include two popular pieces, *When the Saints* and *Eye Level* the theme from a television series. Within twenty years, however, folk traditional had impacted sufficiently upon the Celto-Cornish movement for it to be expected that the processional music would be Cornish. When local processional bands were invited to play for the Bardic procession in Penzance in 2007 and St Ives 2010 they simply drew on a now familiar of body of music recognised as Cornish.

**Conclusion**

This chapter pursues the argument that folk tradition is an abstract process that can be understood using the paradigms of memory, oral history and discursivity. It is a process that is active rather than passive and feeds off emergent Cornish identities as part of its own natural evolution. This is much the point that Dundes and Löffler make with respect to the increasing interest in national identity and folklore in mid-nineteenth century Europe. Whilst the artefacts of the process of folk tradition might be quarried by those seeking material with which to express Cornish identity, the process itself thrives and is fuelled by such a dynamic social environment. Oppositional identity in particular invites a reflectivity in the second existence which privileges an interpretation of distinctiveness. This encourages the incorporation of the Cornish language into folk performance and the search for a distinctive repertoire, musical style and visual presentation.

In the example given above of the development of 5/4 tunes within the session tune repertoire it can be seen that the natural process of change was accelerated by the discourse of Cornish distinctivity. Similarly, it can be seen that the notion of songs belonging to a canon of Cornish material will reinforce the process of selectivity within
folk tradition, the perceived Cornishness will increase the likelihood of its selection. The case of the *Oggie Song* however, shows that this is not just about someone adding a song to a list because it appears to have some kind of connection to Cornwall,76 but rather a more widespread recognition within the community. Of all the fuels for the process of tradition it is costume and the inspiration provided by both Cornwall’s industrial past and twentieth century revivalists which is the most overt and widely evident.

Although the artefacts of tradition are interpreted and used as an expression of Cornishness this remains a far more complex process than merely “inventing tradition”. This chapter argues that rather than causing traditions to be invented Cornish identity has acted as an accelerant for the natural process of folk tradition and that this is symbiotic relationship.

**Notes**

1 See Chapter 1 – Hoerburgers model of first and second existence dance traditions is adapted to apply to folk tradition more broadly.
3 Bernard Deacon “Cornishness and Englishness”.
4 Discussed in detail in chapters 7 and 8 with prime examples being the evolution of the Bodmin Riding and its mummers play and also the increasing significance of Cornish identity in wedding customs.
Chapter 9: Reflective practice and oral folk tradition


12 Annual Cornish language weekend involving workshops, activities, concerts and troyls using Cornish as a medium

13 Barry Schwartz, “Collective Memory and History”, pp. 469-496. Shows how rituals and symbols have shaped the memory and meaning of Abraham Lincoln. Whatever his personal feelings on the matter may have been, in the political arena he advocated racial segregation and yet a hundred years later the Civil Rights movement incorporated his image and statements about freedom together with those of Martin Luther King as part of their poster campaign.


15 Felix Hoerburger, Once Again: On the Concept of Folk Dance" *Journal of the International Folk Music Council "* (1968: 30-I).


17 Participant Observation: 8th and 15th Nov 2006, 6th and 15th Nov 2007, practice and performance of Samba Bands for the Truro City of Lights procession. Cornish dance tunes employed as melody base lines for Samba Bands. The particular value of Samba as a medium for community music is that it can comprise of a series of basic rhythms learned quickly by people without particular music training where variety, interest and musical arrangement is lead by one person who signals change. This is how the Shallal band for the Bolster procession worked, observation / recording / images: 30th April 2006.


19 Bernard Deacon “Cornishness and Englishness”.

20 An issue within Cornish Studies is the confusion between “British” and “English”, whilst “Cornishness could sit comfortably within “Britishness”, “Englishness” was more
Chapter 9: Reflective practice and oral folk tradition


22 Mebyon Kernow – The “Party for Cornwall” was launched in 1951 as a political and cultural pressure group. It adopted a more party political stance in the 1970s but continues to have a high profile in promoting cultural distinctiveness in Cornwall.


24 Pete Berryman, interview with author 15th September 2010.


29 Examples of this can be seen in Lowender Peran Highlights.

30 Participatory action research, 01/11/10: review of the Bodmin Play, how the play associated activities should proceed in 2011. It was suggested that street bands and Guize dance groups should be invited to a “shallal” competition. This is the list that was drawn up of people to contact.

31 Discussed in Chapter 6.

32 Barry Schwartz, “Collective Memory and History”.

33 Jan Assmann, and John Czaplicka, “Collective Memory and Cultural Identity.

34 See Chapter 3.

35 Inglis Gundry, Canow Kernow: songs and dances from Cornwall. (St. Ives, Federation of Old Cornwall Societies, 1966).

36 Peter Kennedy, Folk Songs of Britain and Ireland, (London, Cassell.1975).

37 Forth an Syns – music from an ancient trackway. Pyba, 1995 CD / Cassette, format.
38 Tansys Golowan, *Forth an Syns*.


40 Participant observation: instrumental sessions at The Ring of Bells, St Issey and Liskeard. Neil Davey- Correspondences with author November 2010, Jackie Oates You Tube [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bVcQY6jmUmY](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bVcQY6jmUmY) Accessed 2nd Dec 2010


43 One example of British instrumental music in 5/4 is “Take Five”, composed by Paul Desmond, and popularised by Dave Brubeck Quartet on the album *Time Out* (1959, CS 8192). There is a paradox to discussion here in that due to the unusual time signature “Take Five” became associated with “Modern” as opposed to “Trad” jazz.


46 Inglis Gundry, *Canow Kernow*.

47 Peter Kennedy, *Folk Songs or Britain and Ireland*.


49 Mummerset was a derisory term used by Morton Nance and the early Cornish movement to describe theatrical caricatures of Cornish dialect.


51 Participatory action research, John Ellery, conversation with author, St Columb Old Cornwall Society meeting, 15th November 2010.


53 For example in the debate around the Padstow mummers and the way in which the participants black up their faces critics dismissed the Cornish as provincial racists but did not make this assumption about Morris sides in the home counties. For further
discussion see Merv Davey, "Guizing: Ancient Traditions And Modern Sensitivities." *Cornish Studies* 14, pp. 229 - 244.


56 Journal of the Folk-Song Society, Vol. 8, No. 32 (Dec., 1928), pp. 96-100: Sally Brown was collected by J. E. Thomas from John Farr (aged 76) Gwithian, 6th Dec 1926.

57 Lowender Peran Annual Highlights Video series, (Falmouth, Tower Films, 1987 to 2010) provides a record of the performance of active Cornish dance groups and the costume worn over a 24 year period.


59 See page 36.


62 Ernest E Morton Nance, “Cornish Tartan”, *Cornish Nation* (Redruth, Mebyon Kernow, 1978), this seems to be one of the first explanations of the Cornish Tartan to be published and forms the basis for the description of the tartan as marketed through his son’s enterprise “Gwethnoc”.


64 Josephine Stewart, *The Costume of Cornwall: Workwear of the Newlyn area in the late nineteenth century*. (Bodmin, An Daras Folk Arts Project, 2004). Provides examples of a number of Newlyn School paintings and contemporary photographs which illustrate this.
“The Fish Market”, Lawrence House Museum, Launceston.

Bernard Deacon, 'The Cornish Family: from public narratives to conceptual narratives'. Key Note paper, Narratives of the Family: Exploring Constructions of Kinship and Community Conference, Truro, 16th August 2008. Showed that the absence of men was brought upon by the high mortality rate in both industries and also, in the latter part of the nineteenth century by the decline of the mining industry and the frequent necessity for men to find work abroad.

The Local Government Union, Unison, newsletter in Cornwall was called the “Bal Maiden” and the title pages made clear that these were the reasons for the choice of title.


Participant observation and discussion with performers at Europeade festivals in Mayo 2004, Bromley 2005 and Bromley 2010 provided examples of this from Latvia, Estonia, Slovakia, Sweden and Provence.


See discussion in Chapter 5, the focus of the early Celto-Cornish movement was largely linguistic.

Alan Dundes, "Nationalistic Inferiority Complexes and the Fabrication of Fakelore: A Reconsideration of Ossian, the Kinder- und Hausmarchen, the Kalevala, and Paul Bunyan." Journal of Folklore Research 22(1) 1985, pp. 5-18.

